



BRILL



brill.com/joch

“Chunjiang huayue ye” in the History of Sinographic Literature in East Asia

Bian Dongbo 卞東波

Professor, School of Liberal Arts, Nanjing University, Nanjing, Jiangsu, China
dongbobian@nju.edu.cn

Received 12 June 2023 | Accepted 12 July 2023 |

Published online 29 January 2024

Abstract

Zhang Ruoxu's poem “Chunjiang huayue ye,” reached Japan and Korea in the anthology *Tangshi xuan* compiled by the Ming dynasty scholar Li Panlong. In the mid-Edo period, under the influence of the “Kobunjigaku” (Ancient Rhetoric School) represented by Ogyū Sorai, the *Tangshi xuan* anthology enjoyed a phase of great popularity and became the widest-read Tang poetry work at the time. Because “Chunjiang huayue ye” was included in *Tangshi xuan*, it was also widely read. Many versions of *Tangshi xuan* containing abundant commentaries on “Chunjiang huayue ye” were published in Japan; most of these focus on art appreciation and comment on the poem in considerable depth. China, Japan, and Korea also produced many response poems and imitations of “Chunjiang huayue ye.” Of these, the Chinese imitations were closest to the original work, the Japanese ones had greater ideological depth and echoed the commentaries on the poem, and the Korean ones were all rhymed response poems that were integrated into Korean culture over time. As a literary classic, “Chunjiang huayue ye” transcended its original era and at the same time broke the barriers of space, becoming world literature appreciated by people in other countries.

Keywords

Zhang Ruoxu – Chunjiang huayue ye – *Tangshi xuan* – Sinographic literature in East Asia – world literature

1 Imitations of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in Ming and Qing Literature

Zhang Ruoxu’s 張若虛 (660–720) poem “Chunjiang huayue ye” 春江花月夜 (Spring Blossoms on a Moonlit River) is a classic of East Asian literature: it has been called “the poem of poems, the supreme of supremes,”¹ and it has been said of Zhang Ruoxu that “[his] poem was the only one, and yet it was for everyone.”² Zhang Ruoxu has no individual poetry collections. “Chunjiang huayue ye” has survived thanks to its inclusion in general poetry anthologies. It was first seen in Volume 47 of the *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集. However, for hundreds of years, “Chunjiang huayue ye” did not received the attention it deserved in terms of literary value. Cheng Qianfan 程千帆 (1913–2000) believes that the Jiajing 嘉靖 (1522–1566) period of the Ming (1368–1644) dynasty was a turning point for the fate of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in the literary world. Li Panlong 李攀龍 (1514–1570) chose this poem to be included in his *Gujin shishan* 古今詩刪, and many anthologies of Tang (618–907) poetry compiled during the Ming also selected it.³ At the same time, Hu Yinglin’s 胡應麟 (1551–1602) notes on poetry *Shisou neibian* 詩藪內編 called this poem “smooth and graceful”⁴ and praised it highly. The poem’s literary value was gradually being recognized. “Chunjiang huayue ye” became a classic of East Asian literature, and it connects closely to the spread of book culture and literary thought in East Asia during the Ming dynasty. Cheng Qianfan points out that the reason why the poem was selected for both Li Panlong’s *Gujin shishan* and *Tangshi xuan* 唐詩選 is related to the changes in literary thought in the mid and late Ming dynasty:

Zhang Ruoxu’s work belongs to the same style as the Four Paragons of the Early Tang (Wang Bo 王勃, Yang Jiong 楊炯, Lu Zhaolin 盧照鄰, and Luo Binwang 駱賓王). Therefore, in the history of literature, it has shared the same fate with the Four Paragons, rising and falling the same way. As the status of the Four Paragons improved, their works were also taken

- 1 Wen Yiduo 聞一多, “Gongtishi de zishu” 宮體詩的自贖, in *Tangshi zalun* 唐詩雜論, ed. Wen Yiduo 聞一多 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1998), 18.
- 2 Wang Kaiyun 王闓運, “Wang Zhi” 王誌, in *Xiangqi lou wenji* 湘綺樓文集, ed. Ma Jigao 馬積高 (Changsha: Yuelu shushe, 1996), 1: 2.533.
- 3 Cheng Qianfan 程千帆, “Chunjiang huayue ye’ de bei lijie he bei wujie” 《春江花月夜》的被理解和被誤解, in *Gushi kaosuo* 古詩考索, ed. Cheng Qianfan 程千帆 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1984), 87.
- 4 Hu Yinglin 胡應麟, *Shisou neibian* 詩藪內編 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979), 3.51.

more seriously. This is precisely why Zhang Ruoxu's "Chunjiang huayue ye" appears in many anthologies, starting from Li Panlong's *Gujin shishan*. This poem is in the style of Wang, Yang, Lu, and Luo, and so its historical destiny has fluctuated along with theirs. This is our starting point for understanding this poem.⁵

With the "re-discovery" of "Chunjiang huayue ye," a series of imitation poems emerged from the mid to late Ming period onwards.⁶ Gong Xiuling's 貢修齡 (1574–1641) "Chunye you huai ci Zhang Ruoxu qiyang guyun" 春夜有懷次張若虛七言古韻 is one of these early response poems that maintained the same rhyme scheme (*ciyun shi* 次韻詩):

The spring water and the sea merge on the horizon; spring thoughts grow
with the spring moon.

I am not sure where I am; my eyes only see the moon, shining brightly.
If the moonlight reaches the green fields, the river will be full of flying
droplets.

The river view is vaguely present, but the white sand is not visible.
Colourful clouds dissipate into dust, and the bright moon becomes a full
circle.

May I always be with the moon, and may the moon always shine on the
people on my mind.

How can there be no moon when there is love in life? The moon is also
similar to our emotions.

Far away from the stars, I feel self-pity; the head of the bright river cannot
be seen.

5 Cheng Qianfan, "'Chunjiang huayue ye' de bei lijie he bei wujie," 89–93.

6 Wang Dongliang 王棟樑 and Wang Gang 王剛, "'Chunjiang huayue ye' wenxueshi jiazhi xintan-jieshoushi shiye xia de chanshi" 《春江花月夜》文學史價值新探——接受史視野下的闡釋, *Zhongguo haiyang daxue xuebao* 中國海洋大學學報, no. 1 (2009) shows there are seventeen seven-character works named "Spring Blossoms on a Moonlight River" from the Ming and Qing (1616–1911) period. (There is no information on Gong Xiuling and Qiu Lian's 裘璉 (1644–1729) poems discussed in this article; this could be added.) The three poems discussed in this article are the same as Zhang Ruoxu's poem, and all have thirty-six seven-character lines. Huang Ruheng 黃汝亨 (1558–1626) and Xiong Mingyu 熊明遇 (1579–1649) also authored a seven-character long poem entitled "Chunjiang huayue ye." It was written at about the same time as Gong Xiuling's, and both will have been influenced by the prevailing trends of their time.

The dream of longing is in vain; the pair of us are scattered in two places,
each worried.

The flat boat is not illuminated by the bright moon; the moonlight fills
the place with lovesickness.

The water ripples by the moonlight; my lonely figure projects onto this
jade mirror.

I ponder in pain and humiliation; why do so, when clearly this mood will
repeat?

The sound of a jade flute by the river is unbearable; may it float into the
moon blossom and fly to you.

There is no letter from a messenger in a hundred miles; how can I see
your response poem, embroidered on brocade?

All the plum blossoms have fallen, and so have the apricot blossoms;
as the spring breeze picks up, whose house will it blow them to?

The clear moonlight hangs from the willow branches; their hazy reflec-
tions point westward.

The riverside is covered with mist and clouds; the path by the river comes
and goes.

It is better to return together by the moonlight, as the roselles reflect on
the woods along the river.

無端春水海天平，春思還隨春月生。
望望不知何處是，眼光空到月邊明。
不因月色臨青甸，那得江流盡飛霞。
光景依稀在目前，無那白沙紛不見。
彩雲散作埃與塵，皓魄溶溶方滿輪。
願我時時常傍月，願月時時常照人。
人生有情月豈無，月到意中亦相似。
自憐落落遠於星，不見皎皎江頭水。
思之夢斷枉悠悠，一對鴛鴦兩處愁。
扁舟未得邀明月，空有相思月滿樓。
清波逐月共徘徊，孤影參差玉鏡臺。
漫苦沉吟羞自遣，何當耿耿去還來。
江邊玉笛不堪聞，吹入月華飛到君。
百里不傳青鳥信，一時那見錦回文。
落盡梅花複杏花，春風飄泊阿誰家。
嫋嫋清輝掛楊柳，疏疏倒影又西斜。
江畔迷蒙雲與霧，江上瀟條來去路。
不如乘月卻同歸，洛浦珠光映江樹。

Chen Jiru 陳繼儒 (1558–1639) commented: “Zhang Ruoxu’s work shows the same literary talent of this poem, but in comparison has weaker style, and so this poem can be considered superior.”⁷

Gong excelled at political affairs, and most of his poems are entertainment pieces with little artistic value. Compared with Zhang’s poems, Gong’s poems have similar vocabulary and imagery, but their moods are very different. The beauty of Zhang’s work lies in its subtlety. Under the veil of feelings and separation, it conveys a sense of impermanence in life and the powerlessness of human beings in the face of the infinite universe. This kind of thought is transcendent and has universal significance. Such emotions are conveyed through an overall artistic conception interwoven with images of spring, a river, flowers, the moon, and the night. The universality of Zhang’s poems also reflects in the lyrical subject. Although references to a person such as “人” and “君” also appear in the poem, it is obvious that the “人” in the poem does not refer to a specific individual, but rather to people more universally. The lyrical perspective is also a transcendent perspective on the universe; while the “person” in Gong’s poem can be understood from the context to be missing a woman, the lyrical perspective is specific, which limits the universality of lyricism. Gong’s poem also strives to embed spring, a river, flowers, the moon and the night throughout the poem, but the whole poem is intended to exaggerate the idea of separation, which is a trait inferior to Zhang’s work. Rhyme changes in Zhang’s poem make the levels of lyric more distinct, and thoughts of sorrow, passion, and separation are naturally displayed in the poem through the flow of meaning. Gong’s poem is like a handcuffed dancer: it is restricted by response poems and poem titles, so there is relatively little room for expression. Moreover, the poem uses a high amount of vocabulary from the original poem (such as “white sand” 白沙, “flat boat” 扁舟, “moon blossom” 月華 etc.), which also means the poem cannot extend and grow. Zhang’s poem ends with “the setting moon shakes off the emotions of separation to fill the woods along the river,”⁸ with a lingering aftertaste, while the response poem seems to want to create a glorious ending, which nevertheless is too ordinary. The aftertaste of the original work lingers, but the response poem fails to create a glorious ending. Nevertheless, some lines in Gong’s poem are also praiseworthy, such as “How can there be no moon when there is love in life? The moon is also similar to our emotions.” It is not surprising that people are born with love, but

7 Gong Xiuling 貢修齡, *Doujiutang ji* 斗酒堂集, in vol. 57 of series 5 of *Ming bie ji congkan* 明別集叢刊 (Huangshan: Huangshan shushe, 2016), 1.545.

8 Zhang Ruoxu 張若虛, “Chunjiang huayue ye” 春江花月夜, in *Quan Tangshi* 全唐詩, ed. Peng Dingqiu 彭定求 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1960), 117.1184.

the poet says that the moon also has love, just as the Tang dynasty people said: “the moon still shines on fallen flowers in the courtyard for those who have parted.”⁹ Overall, though, the poem is relatively mediocre.

Although “Chunjiang huayue ye” 春江花月夜 by Li Wen 李雯 (1607–1647) from the Ming and Qing era is not a response poem to Zhang’s poem, it completely imitates it in terms of contents and form:

The Changgan’er young man and the Yuexi girl by the stream are blocked
from crossing the river, complaining about the surge in spring water.
Every time they see the bright moon rise over the river, the flowers on the
river are beautiful.

The shadows of flowers in the river are as bright as spring, and the flow-
ing waves of moonlight shine on people.

A faint mist envelops the water, and the red moonlight floats over the
white sand.

At this time of year, spring swallows return by the river; it is worth meet-
ing at night, flowers in hand.

Three girls on a spring stroll, dressed in flowers, singing a song of joy,
using the moon as a fan.

Pity the girls on the river, the moving silk and green flowers are full of
sorrow.

With no choice but to lean against a tent made of green, one boards the
magnolia boat alone.

The spring breeze pushes the magnolia boat along a clear line, with an
intense fragrance.

The jade door is open wide, no one can sleep; the green sail is filled with
deep emotions.

In endless sorrow, I rest by the river; the parting makes me dream of
Zhuyu Bay in Yangzhou.

I know my loved one left her pearl behind; there is no child to return it
tomorrow.

Carp dart across the river, the green water is covered with beads.

My thoughts of you often follow the clouds of Nanpu, and I know you are
visiting Qiantang again.

Crows perch around fallen flowers in Hengtang; who is that, playing the
pipa (lute) to the moon?

The bright moonlight shines on the melancholic river; the falling flowers
drift towards the wanderer’s abode.

9 Zhang Mi 張泌, “Ji Ren” 寄人, in *Quan Tangshi*, 742.8450.

The wanderer loses himself in the lush springtime, as northern clouds
and southern mist cover the trees by the river.

The moon is dark, orchids are fragrant, his thoughts wander; thoughts of
parting follow the green riverside road in vain.

長干兒郎越溪女，共隔江潮怨春水。
既逢江上明月生，復見江花麗晴綺。
江明花影不勝春，逐月流波宜照人。
淡淡煙中籠水玉，靡靡沙際飄紅綸。
此時江畔春歸燕，更值銜花夜相見。
三春遊女花作衣，一曲歡聞月為扇。
可憐江上雙嬋娟，飛舫動翠愁欲然。
無端自倚青綺帳，安能獨上木蘭船。
木蘭船上春風度，搖曳明紋灼芳素。
玉戶遙開人不眠，綠帆遠漾情無數。
無數愁心江上閑，離人夢到茱萸灣。
安知鮫妾遺珠去，不有明童跨鯉還。
鯉魚撥刺江水急，綠浦沉沉弄珠立。
妾意常隨南浦雲，知君又作錢塘客。
橫塘烏棲繞落花，何人向月彈琵琶。
月明獨照相思浦，花落先飄蕩子家。
蕩子春深不知處，北霧南雲障江樹。
月暗蘭皋芳緒迷，離思空落踏青路。¹⁰

Looking at the end-rhymes of this poem, clearly it is also divided into nine rhyme types, like Zhang's poem. Likewise, it also uses the Xizhou 西洲 style, and makes use of a continuous couplet pattern in many places. The sense of this poem is relatively clear: it is a female lovesickness complaint poem. Through the word *qie* 妾 (concubine), we learn that the lyrical protagonist is the *yuexi nü* 越溪女, and the poem tells of her yearning for *chang gan'er* 長干兒 during a moonlit night on the spring river. She and *chang gan'er* face each other across the river, but the spring river keeps the two from meeting. The word *yuan* 怨 (resentment, lament) shows the intensity of their emotions. The "the flowers on the river are beautiful" line not only describes the beauty of the river blossoms under the bright moon, but also expresses the girl's sorrow for herself as she crosses the stream. Expressions such as "faint mist" form a contrast in the ancient style, describing the hazy beauty of the moon

¹⁰ Li Wen 李雯, *Liao zhai ji* 蓼齋集, in vol. 111 of *Siku jinhui shu congkan, jibu* 四庫禁毀書叢刊·集部 (Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 1997), 15.338.

wrapped in smoke and water. The joy of the spring travels of the three women evokes the sadness of the protagonist, and the beauty of the river also hints at her loneliness. The line “the moving silk and green flowers are full of sorrow” is very well written, and the sentence “sorrow is about to come” intensifies the melancholy. It is therefore logical that the protagonist leans on a green tent and boards the magnolia boat alone, hoping to relieve her inner sorrow. There is no possibility to meet one another in reality, so one can only “dream of Zhuyu Bay.” Zhuyu Bay is often mentioned in Tang poetry, and it is frequently associated with lovesickness. After dreaming of Zhuyu Bay, the protagonist realizes that “you” is being a guest in Qiantang again. Towards the end, the poem returns to the theme of lovesickness, and the five images of spring, river, flower, moon, and night all appear in the last few lines. The “bright moon” at the very beginning of this poem has now become a “dark moon,” symbolizing the inner gloom of the protagonist; the originally “beautiful” river flowers have also become “wandering thoughts,” symbolizing the emotional decline of the protagonist. It is dark, and the “thoughts of parting” in the last sentence expresses the loss and disappointment of the man being missed.

The fifteenth volume of Li Wen's *Liao zhai ji* 蓼齋集 is all in seven-character ancient style, divided into *nigu* 擬古 (imitating the classics) and *shugan* 述感 (expressing feelings). “Chunjiang huayue ye” is the first poem in “imitating the classics.” Li Wen appears to prefer writing poems that imitate ancient poetry. Volumes 3 to 8 of his collection are all *yuefu* 樂府 poems. The first subcategory in five-character poems in Volume 9 is also “imitating classical poetry.” Li Wen wrote many ersatz ancient poems, which may have been influenced by the style of the Ming dynasty, in addition to Li's literary practice. Li's poems do not use the original rhymes of Zhang's poems, so they can move away from the original rhymes of Zhang's poems and gain some room for expression. Li's poetry shows an improvement from Gong Xiuling's poetry, with increased lyrical depth and image density. Li Wen's work can stand on its own, but the imitation traces in this poem are too heavy, and it is still far removed from the charm of Zhang's poems. Zhang's work deals with family resentment, but it does not reflect on life and the universe at all.

Qiu Lian of the Qing dynasty wrote in “Fu de chunjiang huayue ye” 賦得春江花月夜:

The Yangtze River is thousands of miles long, it extends from Xiaoxiang
in the West to Yangzi in the East.
If there is no river flowing, only the spring river can stir the guests' sorrow.
What is known of the guest's sorrow last night? A pity he is drifting in a
boat alone.

Suddenly, a bright moon emerges from the river, and the flood dragons
hidden in the river dance in the water.

The river flows, the moon is bright; in the moonlight, the river sounds
regretful.

Over time, countless people have stood by the river, watching the moon.
Between now and the past, we think of each other, yet can never meet;
only fallen petals float on the water.

The moon follows the river, as bright and shiny as the morning clouds.
I wonder where the fallen flowers have come from; is it from as far as
Wulingyuan, or perhaps only from Tiantaishan?

The fairies in Wulingyuan are tired of the everyday world; meanwhile, Liu
and Ruan, who strayed to Tiantaishan, miss the mundane.

Once flowers bloom and fade, those who look at them cannot bring them
back.

I am a guest today, and I do not recall home; everyone I miss is very far
away.

The woman I miss looks at the moon in her lovesickness, drinking water
from the Xiang River, her tears copious.

What is the point of longing for someone I cannot see? It is just a waste
of time.

The passing of time is in vain; the sound of the river and the moonlight
however are continuous.

Where can I stay tonight? I want to ride a chariot straight to the sky.

Spring on the banks of the Yangtze in Xiaoxiang is nearing its end; the
swallows and shrikes are on their way home.

Riding on a boat carrying the moon, I slept well; I wake up – the moon
sets over the Peach Blossom crossing.

長江浩浩千萬里，西極瀟湘東揚子。
何時不見江水流，惟有春江動客愁。
客愁昨夜知多少，可憐飄泊一孤舟。
忽驚江上明珠吐，冰輪擁出潛蛟舞。
江流流月月華明，月色照江江聲苦。
古來多少見月人，古來多少凌江父。
今古相思不相見，惟有落花浮水面。
爛如濯錦燦流霞，帶月隨江還片片。
我思落花從何來，遠自武陵近天臺。
武陵仙子厭人間，天臺劉阮思塵埃。
花開便有落花時，看花之人去不回。
我今作客不憶家，年年芳草在天涯。

非無望月閨中婦，飲水湘江淚如麻。
 相思不見複何益，空使流年老歲華。
 歲華老去信徒然，江聲月色恨綿綿。
 今夜飄零何處宿，乘槎直欲上青天。
 揚子瀟湘春欲暮，燕子伯勞歸去路。
 何如載月一回眠，醒來月落桃花渡。¹¹

This poem also alternates nine rhymes and uses a “thimble grid,” similar to Zhang’s poem. Some terminology in the poem (such as *xiaoxiang* 瀟湘) also form an intertextuality with Zhang’s poem. This poem captures the essence of Zhang’s poetry. Although it writes of feelings and of lovesickness, it also contains reflections on time and on life. How many people who have seen the moon and how many others have become people of the past in the flow of time? The same moon is watched by different people, and people today cannot see the people who lived earlier. Zhang’s poem tells us of the tranquillity under the moonlight, but Qiu’s poem breaks this tranquillity and creates artistic imagery such as “suddenly, a bright moon emerges from the river, and the flood dragons hidden in the river dance in the water” and writes about the dynamics of moonrise in the Eastern mountains. Qiu also creates imagery of “falling flowers”: not only does this echo the title of the poem; it also connects with the lines that follow. The theme of the impermanence of life is intensified through these falling flowers: “Once flowers bloom and fade, those who look at them cannot bring them back.” The flowers bloom and fall, and the people who look at the flowers never return, which seems to imply a fate that no one can escape, echoing the idea of “watching the moon” above. The text that follows returns to the theme of “guest sorrow” and lovesickness, but the ending is slightly weak and lacks rhyme. Qiu’s poem says, “It is just a waste of time” and “in the moonlight, the river sounds regretful.” Although these two sentences refer to a woman in her abode, are they not also comparisons to the self? This “regret” is not only the sorrow of the lovesickness, but also the poet’s own regret. According to Volume 26 of *Yongzheng Ningbo fuzhi* (雍正) 寧波府志, Qiu Lian was “extremely talented” and passed the imperial examinations at the age of seventy-two. Therefore, the poem also reflects the author’s sense of life experience. In terms of writing style, Qiu’s poems can indeed be considered superior to Zhang’s poem, and both show relatively profound content.

11 Qiu Lian 裘璉, *Hengshan chuji* 橫山初集, in vol. 18 of series 9 of *Siku weishoushu jikan* 四庫未收書輯刊 (Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 2000), 1.12.

2 “Chunjiang huayue ye” and Sinographic Literature in Japan

The earliest appearance of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in Japan’s Chinese literature is in *Kanen ihou* 翰苑遺芳 compiled by Shusu Taigaku 大岳周崇 (1345–1423) in the Muromachi period (1336–1573). In Japan’s Edo period (1603–1868), the Ming scholar Gao Bing’s 高棅 (1350–1423) *Tangshi pinhui* 唐詩品彙 and Li Panlong’s *Gujin shishan* spread eastwards to Japan and it was through Tang poetry anthologies such as these that the Japanese literati were exposed to “Chunjiang huayue ye.” However, the real spread of this poem on a large scale in Japan should be linked to the popularity of Li Panlong’s *Tangshi xuan*. “Chunjiang huayue ye” was included in this collection. *Tangshi xuan* was revised and published by the poet Hattori Nankaku 服部南郭 (1683–1759) in the ninth year (1724) of the Kyōho era to then become the most popular reader of Tang poetry in the Edo period.¹² The popularity of *Tangshi xuan* is closely connected to the admiration of the Kobunjigaku School (古文辭學派) represented by Ogyū Sorai 荻生徂徠 (1666–1728) for the Later Seven Masters, represented by Li Panlong and Wang Shizhen 王世貞 (1526–1590).¹³ There was a series of annotated editions in Chinese of *Tangshi xuan* in the Edo period, many of which contained commentaries on “Chunjiang huayue ye.” The one with relatively high value in terms of literary criticism is *Tangshi jujie* 唐詩句解 by Irie Nanmei 入江南溟 (1678–1765).

The interpretation of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in *Tangshi jujie* is profound in some lines, such as in “I don’t know who the moon on the river is awaiting, all I can see is the Yangtze sending a flow of water.” (不知江月照何人，但見長江送流水) It says:

12 *Tangshi xuan* spread eastward to Japan in the first year of Genna (1615–1624). See Kondō Haruo 近藤春雄, *Nihon kanbungaku daijiten* 日本漢文學大事典 (Tokyo: Meiji shoin, 1985), 771. According to Jiang Yin 蔣寅, there are as many as 129 editions of *Tangshi xuan* published in Japan. See: Jiang Yin 蔣寅, “Jiuti Li Panlong *Tangshi xuan* zai riben de liuchuan yu yingxiang-Riben jieshou Zhongguo wenxue de yige cemian” 舊題李攀龍《唐詩選》在日本的流傳與影響——日本接受中國文學的一個側面, in *Shijiao yu fangfa: Zhongguo wenxueshi tansuo* 視角與方法：中國文學史探索, ed. Jiang Yin 蔣寅 (Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2018), 522; Ōba Takuya 大庭卓也, “Wakoku *tōshisen* shupan no seikyo” 和刻『唐詩選』出版の盛況, in *Sōkai ni kawasareru shibun* 蒼海に交わされる詩文, ed. Horikawa Takashi 堀川貴司 and Asami Yōji 淺見洋二 (Tokyo: Kyūko shoin, 2012); and Arikai Daisuke 有木大輔, *Tōshisen hanpon kenkyū* 唐詩選版本研究 (Tokyo: Kōbun shupan, 2013).

13 “The reason why scholars of the Kenen School admired the *Tangshi xuan* is that the ideological connection with the ‘Kobunjigaku School,’ academically, is inseparable from Li Panlong’s stance.” See Jiang Yin, “Jiuti Li Panlong *Tangshi xuan* zai riben de liuchuan yu yingxiang,” 544.

The poem is a lament about the impermanence of life. It is intricately written, saying that when people see the moon and the moonlight shines on them, they do not know anything about the beginning. Life changes constantly, but the moon over the river has never changed, and we no longer see the people from earlier. I wonder who the moon was shining on over the river at the beginning. People go and never return; they approach the Yangtze and feel the water flowing.¹⁴

These two poems reflect a time consciousness typical of people in ancient China. Commentaries on “Chunjiang huayue ye” during the Ming and Qing Dynasties mostly stated that the poem was about “gazing at the moon and missing home,”¹⁵ or that the emotions in the poem were *guisi* 閨思 “yearning in the boudoir,” *keqing* 客情 “sentiments of travelers,” *yijia* 憶家 “remembering home” and so on; these are relatively superficial views. The reason why Zhang’s poem has become a literary classic lies in its ability to convey universal human emotions on top of specific emotions, which is what Irie Nanmei calls “the sense of impermanence of life.”

Given the popularity of *Tangshi xuan* in Japan, “Chunjiang huayue ye” was widely read, and many imitations were written in Japan. Ogyū Sorai has a version of “Chunjiang huayue ye” of his own, but this poem is a five-syllable (per line) poem and is not completely consistent with Zhang’s poem in terms of poetic style. In addition to Zhang’s seven-syllable style, the “Chunjiang huayue ye” popular in China also included two five-syllable quatrains by Emperor Yang of Sui 隋煬帝 (r. 604–618). Even though Ogyū’s poem is not an answer poem to Zhang’s work, it does derive from Zhang’s poem, and draws inspiration from Emperor Yang’s poem. The first two couplets of the poem rhyme “*ming* 明” with “*sheng* 生,” similarly to Zhang’s poem; this should therefore be a direct influence from Zhang’s work. The first half of the poem describes the scenery. The spring river and forest flowers under the moonlight are of charming beauty. “The fragrance in the shadows is fresh and light.”¹⁶ This sentence is particularly poetic, as if the sweet fragrance of forest flowers had penetrated the moon shadows, which will have been inspired by the line “the night dew contains the

14 Bian Dongbo 卞東波 and Shi Lishan 石立善, eds., *Zhongguo wenji riben guzhu ben congkan* 中國文集日本古注本叢刊 (Shanghai: Shanghai shehui kexueyuan, 2020), 2: 2.630.

15 Tang Ruxun 唐汝詢, *Tangshi jie* 唐詩解, in vol. 369 of *Siku quanshu cunmu cunshu* 四庫全書存目存書 (Jinan: Qilu shushe, 1997), 11.706.

16 Ogyū Sorai 荻生徂徠, “Shunkōkagetsunoyoru” 春江花月夜, in *Soraishū* 徂徠集, vol. 116 of *Riben hanwenxue baijia ji* 日本漢文學百家集, ed. Wang Yan 王焱 (Beijing: Beijing yanshan chubanshe, 2019), 1.25.

fragrance of flowers”¹⁷ in the poem of Emperor Yang of Sui. At the end of the poem, it says: “the moon over the river suddenly disappears, and the flowers on the river cannot bloom.”¹⁸ On the surface, this is about the moon over the river and the flowers on the river, but in fact it expresses the meaning of life: a certain sense of impermanence. The last line is: “only the tide on the river still surrounds Jiangcheng.”¹⁹ This work has the charm of a poem, with a lingering rhyme; the words used are limited, but there are no boundaries to its meaning.

Again, looking at Itō Tōgai's 伊藤東涯 (1670–1736) “Kōjyōkagetsunouta” 江上花月歌:

You better not look at the moon on the river, because it makes one feel
time is fleeting and years are rushing by.

You should not admire the flowers on the river; they bloom and fall in
Spring and Autumn.

The river blossoms and the moon are fierce; they bloom and wither, and
rise and fall, without any rest.

Don't you see the gold in the emerald tent; the hall full of instruments is
silent.

Spending year after year looking at the moon and admiring flowers, I can-
not believe there is sorrow in this world.

Looking at Wuling's youthful spirit, like a rainbow, riding a horse with a
green brocade saddle.

Looking at the moon, admiring the flowers, day after day, taking another
trip to everywhere.

Wealth is not permanent, and people tend to pass on; where in the world
is the land where immortals live?

The fate of the wealthy is to be covered in loess, their hair turning green,
then white.

No one enquires about the white-haired loess, there is only the white
moon and the red flowers.

People in the universe are like ants; who can leave their name in the
universe?

勸君莫看江上月，江月促年容易流。

勸君莫賞江上花，江花飛飛春又秋。

江花江月太無情，盈虧開落不肯休。

君不見翡翠帳中金鑿落，滿堂絲竹陸海羞。

17 Guo Maoqian 郭茂倩, ed., *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1979), 47.678.

18 Ogyū Sorai, “Shunkōkagetsunoyoru,” 1.26.

19 Ibid.

看月賞花度年年，不信人間有底愁。
 又不看五陵年少氣如虹，鈿鞍寶馬綠錦韉。
 看月賞花出日日，東阡南陌取次遊。
 富貴無常人易老，人間何處有丹丘。
 朱門人去掩黃土，綠鬢時換忽白頭。
 白頭黃土無人問，月白花紅自悠悠。
 悠悠宇宙人如蟻，誰將姓名宇宙留？²⁰

Itō Tōgai was the son of Itō Jinsai 伊藤仁斎 (1627–1705), the founder of the Kogigaku School (古義學派). Both the Kogigaku School and the Kobunjigaku School, to which Ogyū Sorai was affiliated, were known for their anti-Zhu Xi 朱熹 (1130–1200) ideology. Ogyū and Itō were contemporaries. They both drafted their own versions of “Chunjiang huayue ye” and may have been influenced by the popularity of *Tangshi xuan*. Itō’s poem is not an outright imitation of Zhang’s poem. The words *chun* 春 (spring) and *ye* 夜 (night) in the original work do not appear in the title of his poem. However, this poem continues the theme of the impermanence of life found in Zhang’s poem and Zhang is even quoted directly. The sentence “Wealth is not permanent, and people tend to pass on” is the core idea contained in this poem. Spring, river, flowers, the moon, and night are five independent and closely connected images in Zhang’s poem, and Itō highlights the two images of “moon on the river” and “flowers on the river,” which is intended to express the idea that “the moon on the river makes one feel time is fleeting and years are rushing by.” In it, a person feels powerless in grasping the passage of life, and as autumn follows spring by the river, an individual feels they are unable to restore the sequence of time. The river flowers and the river moon are originally very poetic images, but in the face of the eternal universe, their “rising and falling” are images independent of the human will, and in the poem they appear as “fierce.” Therefore, whether it is the gold ornaments in the emerald tent or the Wuling youthful spirit like a rainbow, these will eventually become rusty, or turn into dust in the face of time. As a Confucian who believes in rationalism, Itō does not believe in the existence of Danqiu 丹丘 (the land of immortals). The last two lines of this poem raise the theme of the poem to the level of the universe. In the face of the eternal universe, humans are as insignificant as ants. As a Confucian scholar, Itō thinks about how to leave his own traces in the universe, thereby overcoming the tension caused by the impermanence of the moon and the flowers. This poem by Itō not only reflects on the impermanence of wealth, but also questions the universe and life. It can be said to be a poem

20 Itō Tōgai 伊藤東涯, *Shōjutsu sensei bunshū* 紹述先生文集, vol. 122 of *Riben hanwenxue baijiu ji*, 21.499–500.

with considerable philosophical depth among East Asian works that imitate “Chunjiang huayue ye.”

3 “Chunjiang huayue ye” and Sinographic Literature in Korea

The spread of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in Korea is connected to the literary exchanges between China and Korea in the Ming dynasty. During the reign of King Sŏnjo 宣祖 of Chosŏn (r. 1568–1608), the works and literary thoughts of Li Panlong and Wang Shizhen had spread onto the Korean Peninsula and enjoyed a widespread influence. In Volume 34 of the *Nongamjip* 農巖集, Kim Ch'ang-hyŏp 金昌協 (1651–1708) says: “In the times of King Sŏnjo, literati were thriving, and many among them studied materials from the Tang dynasty. The poems of Wang and Li were gradually spreading eastwards, and people began to admire and imitate them.”²¹

Before King Sŏnjo, it was popular in Korean poetry circles to imitate the Song (960–1279) dynasty style. During the Sŏnjo period, a wave of ancestral-style Tang poetry emerged, represented by the “Three Tang” (*santang* 三唐) poets.²² With the arrival of the poems of Wang and Li to the east, the retrospective theory of “ancient rhetoric” (*guwen* 古文辭) advocated by the mid-Ming dynasty scholars also became popular in Korea. Poetry anthologies compiled by people in the Ming dynasty, such as *Gujin shishan* and the *Tangshi pinhui*,²³ spread to Korea, and so Korean literati also read “Chunjiang huayue ye” in these anthologies. In his *Namchŏn illok* 南遷日錄, Song Sang-ki 宋相琦 (1657–1723)

21 Kim Ch'ang-hyŏp 金昌協, *Nongamjip* 農巖集, vol. 162 of *Han'guk munjip ch'onggan* 韓國文集叢刊, Minjok munhwa Ch'ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 1996 edition, 34:377.

22 See Zhang Jingkun 張景昆, *Tangshi jieshoushi yanjiu-yi chaoxian xuanzu shiqi wei zhongxin* 唐詩接受史研究——以朝鮮宣祖時期為中心 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2022).

23 In the 15th year of King Seongjong's 成宗 reign (r. 1469–1494) before Sŏnjo, Jiachen 甲辰 characters were new, and Tang poetry anthologies such as the *Tangshi pinhui* were published in Jiachen characters, paving the way for later thought that takes the Tang dynasty as its model. “Ti Tangjue xuanshan xu” 題唐絕選刪序 in vol. 50 of Ho Kyun 許筠 (1569–1618)'s *Songso pubugo* 惺所覆瓿稿: “In my spare time, I took Cangming's 滄溟 *Shishan* 詩刪, Xu Zichong's 徐子允 *Baijia xuan* 百家選, Yang Boqian's 楊伯謙 *Tangyin* 唐音, Gao's *Pinhui* and other books ...” Ho Kyun 許筠, *Songso pubugo* 惺所覆瓿稿, vol. 74 of *Han'guk munjip ch'onggan* 韓國文集叢刊, Minjok munhwa Ch'ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 1996 edition, 50:185. The so-called “Cangming's *Shishan*” refers to Li Panlong's *Gujin shishan*; “Gao's *Pinhui*” refers to Gao Bing's *Tangshi pinhui*; both books include “Chunjiang huayue ye.” South Korea now preserves many versions of *Tangshi pinhui*, including engraved editions from the Ming dynasty, Qing editions, Korean editions and manuscripts. See Chŏn In-ch'o 全寅初, ed., *Han'guk sojang Chungguk hanjŏk ch'ongmok* 韓國所藏中國漢籍總目 (Seoul: Hakkobang, 2005), 5: 91–95.

says: “Over the past years, I have been busy with official duties from morning to night every day, and I am exhausted. Whenever it is late at night and the moon is in the sky, I will begin to recite Tang poems such as Zhang Ruoxu’s ‘Chunjiang huayue’ and Bai Juyi’s 白居易 ‘Pipa xing’ 琵琶行 to express my feelings. These two poems are both works that I like to read.”²⁴ Clearly, “Chunjiang huayue ye” had become routine reading material for Korean literati.

Versions of “Chunjiang huayue ye” in Korea’s Chinese literature are all response poems. Kim Yang-gŭn’s 金養根 (1754–1809) “Ch’a jang yak’ŏ ch’un’gang hwawŏl ya un” 次張若虛春江花月夜韻 says:

The river sand gathers and disperses; patches of clouds are scattered
across the sky.
With the bright moonlight on the river, the orchids and begonias on the
shore appear to be clearer.
Just as flowers are in full bloom in the fields, how can one say they will
wither and float like snowflakes?
The flower fragrance and the moonlight linger on a railing; who is watch-
ing the moon with us from far away?
There is no trace of dust on the moon, which slowly rises in the East like
a wheel.
This night beauty will last no longer than then days; who will come to
enjoy the flowers and toy with the moon thereafter?
The evening rain on the balcony does not stop; the hand caressing the
peonies resembles their face.
The first song welcomes the man and the full moon; the river rushes with
spring water.
The spring water can become shallow, I look at it for a long time; it weeps
like a plaintive, melancholic *sheng* organ melody.
It was almost the third watch of the night by the time of my evening
appointment, but she was still leaning on her lovesickness wall with
fresh makeup.
Peacocks fly southeast and linger; vines hang from the yellow platform in
the distance.
The second song welcomes the man, the moon is like a dream; her soul
comes and goes.
I have various things you should hear about; I also have some tea for you
to drink.

24 Song Sang-ki 宋相琦, *Namchŏn illok* 南遷日錄, in vol. 4 of *Hanguo shihua quanbian jiaozhu* 韓國詩話全編校注, ed. Cai Meihua 蔡美花 and Zhao Ji 趙季 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2012), 4: 2892.

How can the lotus dew turn dry, and the sound of the instrument carry
Zhao Wenjun?

The third song welcomes the man as he steps on the flowers; the fragrance of the night is suitable for his home.

The green quilt in the empty lovesickness reminds of the night, the flowers on the river wither and the moon sinks at an angle.

The lush flowers are shrouded in the mist; unfortunately, the best time has passed.

Confused by separation, mandarin ducks fly across the river, as the setting moon looms through the acacia trees.

江沙聚散苦難平，江雲片片隨處生。
更看江心娟娟月，岸芝海棠遙分明。
政爾花發迷春句，豈說花老飄如霰。
花香和月上欄幹，千里此夜誰共見？
琉璃寶榻絕一塵，少焉漸高東山輪。
良宵易曉無十日，探花玩月來何人？
陽臺暮雨望未已，手撫芍藥顏與似。
一曲迎郎月初圓，大江滔滔生春水。
春水可淺我望悠，如訴鳳笙空惹愁。
黃昏有約三更近，奈此新妝憑翠樓。
東南孔雀飛徘徊，葛蔓遠遠垂黃台。
二曲迎郎月如夢，渾渾淖淖魂去來。
我有雜珮君應聞，我有清茶要勸君。
如何荷露轉輕薄，琴心徒爾搖卓文。
三曲迎郎更踏花，晚晚芳辰宜君家。
空閨翠被夜何似，江花易老江月斜。
濛濛花外暮年霧，可憐佳期違中路。
無心鷺鷥江上飛，落月依微相思樹。²⁵

The meaning in Zhang's poem is relatively profound, but this poem is thematically limited to grievances between friends in the boudoir; the identity of the protagonist in Zhang's poem is relatively vague, but the protagonist of this poem is a woman. Zhang's poem shows clear consciousness of the universe when expressing emotions: "Who was it who first saw the moon by the river? When did the moon on the river first shine on people?"²⁶ These are

25 Kim Yang-gŭn 金養根, *Dongya jip* 東莖集, vol. 94 of *Han'guk munjip ch'onggan sok* 韓國文集叢刊續, Han'guk kojŏn bŏnyŏgwŏn 韓國古典翻譯院, 2010 edition, 3: 61.

26 Zhang Ruoxu, "Chunjiang huayue ye," 1184.

questions about life and have universal significance. The rhetorical questions of this poem, however, such as “who is watching the moon with us tonight, from far away?” are limited to the author’s own personal time and space, thus seeming less grand in scope than Zhang’s poem. If we look at literary techniques, the poem introduces repetitive and progressive syntax: “The first song welcomes the man and the full moon,” “The second song welcomes the man, and the moon is like a dream,” “The third song welcomes the man as he steps on the flowers”; the poem borrows the tone of a man longing for a woman to express how the author misses a good and dear person. Write down the longing for your beloved, and the feeling of longing changes with the passage of time. At the time of the full moon, lovers made an appointment after dusk, wearing new makeup and leaning against their abode, looking sadly at people in the distance, but they could not see the person they had missed for a long time, only vines hanging from a yellow platform. The bright moon is in the sky, the moonlight is like a dream, the lotus dew is thinning, one puts their heart into music, but no one responds. The moon is setting in the west, and dawn is about to end the night. The missing woman is alone in the empty lovesickness, hugging the green cloth alone, and has not seen her beloved yet. River flowers wither easily, implying that beauty ages easily. The last couplet talks about a pair of mandarin ducks flying together, but this is really a metaphor for being alone in an empty house. In the poem, Kim Yang-gŭn uses the traditional conversive style to try and understand the thoughts of a wife. Although the feelings are sincere, they are not detailed enough in the end.

Cho In-yŏng 趙寅永 (1782–1850) says in his “Kajil byŏnggu bodangin jangyakŏ ch’un’gang hwawŏl un yŏngsang wŏnwŏl yo byŏnhaebu jisun dongbu jak shisa ilgasa yŏyŏk kujŏm hŭich’a” 家侄秉龟步唐人张若虚春江花月韵咏上元月邀卞海夫持淳同赋作诗社一佳事余亦口占戏次:

The moon of the first lunar month is as round as a jade plate, and the red osmanthus flowers are full of life in spring.

A year is a circle of twelve units; the moon is brightest when it reaches the first lunar month.

The stars surround the moon, as if guarding a capital city; the river water looks like ice melted by the morning sun.

It is rare to see a hundred years of life, was it not for the rain and clouds. Abundant mud and dust roll along the busy spring road.

Such a beautiful night and bright moon, blessed with happiness is one who enjoys them.

I already know how to write poems to the moon, but drinking to the moon is nothing like it.

The plum blossoms and willows on the riverbank are budding with
 colour, and the ice on the river swells with water.
 The leisurely moonlight shines on the water; drinking keeps one busy,
 and writing poetry is a worry.
 Why go to the Bridge of the Red Rails to watch the moon? At the fifth
 watch in the morning, the moonlight will fill the room.
 The moon and the shadows linger together, tenderly illuminating this
 soul of mine.
 The spring feeling is pleasant, the atmosphere of the night light; no dirt
 can stain it.
 I sing under the spring moon, please listen; only you care for me, and I
 am your only one.
 As time passes by, hair gradually turns white; if one is too excited, it is
 impossible to use the written word.
 Once the moon is full, it will be waning; this is a principle discussed in
 the *Book of Changes*.
 Because this festival is named after the moon, it is a shame that the moon
 in the West is already setting.
 Immortals do not talk of riding the clouds and mist, and yet travellers
 complain of the long journey.
 How much moonlight do others have, compared to me? In the spring
 garden, trees spiral up and down.

上元月如玉盤平，丹桂逢春魄盡生。
 一年一十二度圓，月到上元月最明。
 星是侯服環畿甸，江是朝日燭冰霰。
 除卻雨灑雲綴外，浮生百歲凡幾見。
 三尺泥與十丈塵，滾滾春陌忙蹄輪。
 如此良宵如此月，消受合是清福人。
 對月哦詩詩能已，對月飲酒酒何似。
 濱梅汀柳亦生色，江冰已泮盈盈水。
 水上即月閑悠悠，酒為忙事詩為愁。
 何必赤欄橋頭行，五更明月複滿樓。
 月與人影共徘徊，脈脈相照此靈台。
 春意藹處夜氣虛，未許一點滓穢來。
 我歌春月倩君聞，愛我好我惟夫君。
 冉冉流光頭漸皓，興到欲狂焉用文。
 月圓則虧未圓好，此理曾講讀《易》家。
 只為以月名佳節，偏惜西峰月已斜。

仙子謾說乘雲霧，遊人空歎在道路。
較我月色誰多少，春園更有盤桓樹。²⁷

Although this poem is a response to Zhang’s poem, it is not as close to the original as the Chinese versions. The correlation between this poem and the original poem is weak. In a poem entitled “Chunjiang huayue ye,” most attention is given to the moon. The moon is in the poem’s title, while the other four key images are less prominent. The detachment and lovesickness thoughts that are found in Zhang’s poems do not appear in this poem at all. Because this poem was written for the “Poetry Society” (*shishe* 詩社), the poem highlights a communicative coloration. This poem also has a distinct characteristic of Chinese poetry in Korea, which is to incorporate logic into the poem. During the Chosŏn era (1392–1910), Zhu Xi’s ideology was the mainstream ideological doctrine. When Korean scholars were writing articles, they could not help but use poetry to express their reasoning. According to Yun Chong-hyŏn’s 尹定鉉 (dates unknown) “*Unsŏk yugo seo*” 雲石遺稿序, Cho In-yŏng’s father “was proficient in studying the *Book of Changes*.” Cho In-yŏng may also have been influenced by his family’s studies, and this is why his poem also has lines such as “Once the moon is full, it will wane. This principle has been discussed in the *Book of Changes*.”²⁸ Although this poem is a “playful” response, because the author invested a lot of personal emotions in it, the meaning is relatively profound.

4 Conclusion

As a literary classic, “Chunjiang huayue ye” has had a mixed reception in the history of modern Chinese literature in East Asia. The similarity is that the canonization of “Chunjiang huayue ye” is closely related to the spread of literary ideas in East Asia by Li Panlong, Wang Shizhen and others among the Later Seven Masters (*hou qi zi* 後七子). Li and Wang’s ideology of returning to classical writing changed the fate of this poem, while books such as *Gujin shishan* and *Tangshi xuan* compiled by Li Panlong or published under his name promoted the reading of the poem in East Asia. The thoughts of Li and Wang spread eastward to Japan and Korea, triggering the tendency to return to

27 Cho In-yŏng 趙寅永, *Unsŏk yugo* 雲石遺稿, vol. 299 of *Han’guk munjip ch’onggan* 韓國文集叢刊, Minjok munhwa ch’ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 2002 edition, 2: 33–34.

28 Cho In-yŏng, *Unsok yugo*, 3.

classics and Tang dynasty poetry style in both countries. It was in this cultural atmosphere that “Chunjiang huayue ye” was read, understood, and imitated.

The reception of “Chunjiang huayue ye” was also very different in the three countries discussed in this paper. In the long term, from the perspective of Chinese literature, East Asian annotations, reviews, and drafts of the poem basically all appeared in the 17th and 18th centuries. However, there is a time lag in the acceptance of the poem by these same three countries. Drafts of, and commentaries on, the poem appeared in China from the mid to late Ming dynasty; Japan was influenced by the Kobunjigaku School and by *Tangshi xuan* about a century later, and many drafts and annotations then appeared because of this. Korea was influenced by Li and Wang’s return to the classical thought earlier, but response poems to “Chunjiang huayue ye” appeared latest in Korea. Although imitations of the poem in the history of Chinese literature within East Asia are all closely connected to Zhang’s poem, and most of them are direct response poems, the imitations are quite different in the three respective countries. The Chinese ones are relatively close to the original poem, and the imagery, vocabulary, and themes used are basically directly derived from Zhang’s work. Therefore, these works cannot escape the influence of the original poem, and consequently lack innovation in conception and technique. There are no response works in Japan, so there is no need to follow the rules of Zhang’s writing style. Many Japanese authors of imitation poems were Confucianists, and their philosophical thought runs through their work, highlighting the theme of wealth being impermanent and that of people ageing easily, thus echoing the interpretation of Edo sinologists, who say that “Chunjiang huayue ye” is about “the impermanence of life.” Although Korean response poems are like Zhang’s work in terms of sound and rhyme, they deviate from the original lyrical paradigm of Zhang’s poem. In some lines, Korean cultural elements are integrated into these works, adding Neo-Confucian elements to the poems.

Translated by Caterina Weber

Works Cited

- Ariki, Daisuke 有木大輔. *Tōshisen hanpon kenkyu* 唐詩選版本研究. Tokyo: Kōbun shupan, 2013.
- Bian, Dongbo 卞東波 and Shi Lishan 石立善, eds. *Zhongguo wenji riben guzhu ben con-gkan* 中國文集日本古注本叢刊. Shanghai: Shanghai shehui kexueyuan, 2020.

- Cheng, Qianfan 程千帆. “Chunjiang huayue ye’ de bei lijie he bei wujie” 《春江花月夜》的被理解和被誤解. In *Gushi kaosuo* 古詩考索, edited by Cheng Qianfan 程千帆, 80–95. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1984.
- Cho, In-yŏng 趙寅永. *Unsŏk yugo* 雲石遺稿. Vol. 299 of *Han’guk munjip ch’onggan* 韓國文集叢刊. Minjok munhwa ch’ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 2002.
- Chŏn, In-ch’o 全寅初, ed. *Han’guk sojang Chungguk hanjŏk ch’ongmok* 韓國所藏中國漢籍總目. Seoul: Hakkobang, 2005.
- Gong, Xiuling 貢修齡. *Doujiutang ji* 斗酒堂集. In vol. 57 of series 5 of *Ming bie ji congkan* 明別集叢刊. Huangshan: Huangshan shushe, 2015.
- Guo, Maoqian 郭茂倩, ed. *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1979.
- Ho, Kyun 許筠. *Songso pubugo* 惺所覆瓿稿. Vol. 74 of *Han’guk munjip ch’onggan* 韓國文集叢刊. Minjok munhwa Ch’ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 1996.
- Hu, Yinglin 胡應麟. *Shisou neibian* 詩藪·內編. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979.
- Itō, Tōgai 伊藤東涯. *Shōjutsu sensei bunshū* 紹述先生文集. Vol. 122 of *Riben hanwenxue baijia ji* 日本漢文學百家集. Edited by Wang Yan 王焱. Beijing: Beijing yanshan chubanshe, 2019.
- Jiang, Yin 蔣寅. “Jiuti Li Panlong *Tangshi xuan zai riben de liuchuan yu yingxiang*—Riben jieshou Zhongguo wenxue de yige cemian” 舊題李攀龍《唐詩選》在日本的流傳與影響——日本接受中國文學的一個側面. In *Shijiao yu fangfa: Zhongguo wenxueshi tansuo* 視角與方法：中國文學史探索, edited by Jiang Yin 蔣寅, 521–48. Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2018.
- Kim, Ch’ang-hyŏp 金昌協. *Nongamjip chip* 農巖集. Vol. 162 of *Han’guk munjip ch’onggan* 韓國文集叢刊. Minjok munhwa Ch’ujinhoe 民族文化推進會, 1996.
- Kim, Yang-gŭn 金養根. *Dongya jip* 東莖集. Vol. 94 of *Han’guk munjip ch’onggan sok* 韓國文集叢刊續. Han’guk kojŏn bŏnyŏgwŏn 韓國古典翻譯院, 2010.
- Kondō, Haruo 近藤春雄. *Nihon kanbungaku daijiten* 日本漢文學大事典. Tokyo: Meiji shoin, 1985.
- Li, Wen 李雯. *Liao zhai ji* 蓼齋集. In vol. 111 of *Siku jinhui shu congkan, jibu* 四庫禁毀書叢刊·集部. Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 1997.
- Ōba, Takuya 大庭卓也. “Wakoku *tōshisen shupan no seikyo*” 和刻『唐詩選』出版の盛況. In *Sōkai ni kawasareru shibun* 蒼海に交わされる詩文, edited by Takashi Horikawa 堀川貴司 and Asami Yōji 淺見洋二, 171–206. Tokyo: Kyuko shoin, 2012.
- Ogyū, Sorai 荻生徂徠. *Soraishū* 徂徠集. Vol. 116 of *Riben hanwenxue baijia ji* 日本漢文學百家集. Edited by Wang Yan 王焱. Beijing: Beijing yanshan chubanshe, 2019.
- Qiu, Lian 裘璉. *Hengshan chuji* 橫山初集. In vol. 18 of series 9 of *Siku weishoushu jikan* 四庫未收書輯刊. Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 2000.
- Song, Sang-ki 宋相琦. *Namch’ŏn illok* 南遷日錄. In vol. 4 of *Hanguo shihua quanbian jiaozhu* 韓國詩話全編校注, edited by Cai Meihua 蔡美花 and Zhao Ji 趙季. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2012.

- Tang, Ruxun 唐汝詢. *Tangshi jie* 唐詩解. In vol. 369 of *Siku quanshu cunmu cunshu* 四庫全書存目存書. Jinan: Qilu shushe, 1997.
- Wang, Dongliang 王棟樑 and Wang Gang 王剛. “Chunjiang huayue ye’ wenxueshi jiazhi xintan-jieshoushi shiye xia de chanshi” 《春江花月夜》文學史價值新探——接受史視野下的闡釋. *Zhongguo haiyang daxue xuebao* 中國海洋大學學報, no. 1 (2009): 76–80.
- Wang, Kaiyun 王闓運. “Wang Zhi” 王志. In *Xiangqi lou wenji* 湘綺樓文集, edited by Ma Jigao 馬積高, 1: 487–552. Changsha: Yuelu shushe, 1996.
- Wen, Yiduo 聞一多. “Gongtishi de zishu” 宮體詩的自贖. In *Tangshi zalun* 唐詩雜論, edited by Wen Yiduo 聞一多, 9–19. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1998.
- Zhang, Jingkun 張景昆. *Tangshi jieshoushi yanjiu-yi chaoxian xuanzu shiqi wei zhongxin* 唐詩接受史研究——以朝鮮宣祖時期為中心. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2022.
- Zhang, Mi 張泌. “Ji Ren” 寄人. In *Quan Tangshi* 全唐詩, edited by Peng Dingqiu 彭定求, 742.8450. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1960.
- Zhang, Ruoxu 張若虛. “Chunjiang huayue ye” 春江花月夜. In *Quan Tangshi* 全唐詩, edited by Peng Dingqiu 彭定求, 1183–84. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1960.